

February 10, 2014

The Honorable Cheryl A. LaFleur, Acting Chairman
The Honorable Philip D. Moeller, Commissioner
The Honorable John R. Norris, Commissioner
The Honorable Tony Clark, Commissioner

Federal Energy Regulatory Commission
888 First Street, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20426

Re: *Centralized Capacity Markets in Regional Transmission Organizations and Independent System Operators*, Docket No. AD13-7-000

Dear Acting Chairman and Commissioners:

The undersigned entities comprise a broad and diverse *ad hoc* group of publicly and cooperatively owned electric utilities, national consumer and low-income organizations, state public utility commissions, state consumer advocates, investor-owned utilities, industrial customers, and independent power producers. While we represent a range of diverse and often diverging interests, we are writing to emphasize our consensus on certain of the core points made in many of the comments filed in the above-noted docket on January 8, 2014:

- Capacity Is Not Fungible. Not all MWs of capacity are created equal. Load serving entities (LSEs), states, and local regulatory bodies may have excellent policy reasons for preferring to assemble a diverse portfolio of generation and demand-side resources to serve retail electric needs.
- Many Policy Considerations Affect Resource Portfolio Choices. The policy concerns that might lead LSEs, state and local regulatory bodies to favor local generation over distant generation, newer, more efficient resources over older, less efficient ones, lower-emitting resources over higher-emitting resources, *etc.*, are completely legitimate. Federal policy makers should respect and honor them. Market rules that Regional Transmission Organizations (RTOs) impose to protect prices under administrative capacity procurement constructs should not erect barriers to meeting such policy goals.
- Long-term Contracts Support New Resources and Should Be Encouraged. Capacity surpluses can no longer be taken for granted; new resources will have to be developed to comply with new environmental regulations. At such a time, long-term contracting and self-supply generation should be encouraged and supported, rather than being considered an “out-of-market” subsidy. RTO market rules that effectively penalize long-term contracting and self-supply should be reformed.

- The Commission Must Consider Rate Impacts on Retail Electric Consumers. Market participants wishing to protect their economic interests dominate Commission adjudicative dockets and RTO stakeholder processes. In these fora, the interests of retail consumers and those charged with protecting them are often lost. It is up to the Commission to ensure that capacity procurement constructs and the associated market rules work for the retail electric consumers that ultimately pay the bills, and not just for those market participants with the most resources to devote to the administrative process.

The undersigned entities respectfully request the Commission to take further actions in relevant adjudicative and rulemaking dockets to ensure that these principles are honored in RTO capacity procurement mechanisms. We stand ready to work with the Commission to help make this happen.

Respectfully submitted,

AARP

David Certner
Legislative Counsel and Legislative Policy Director
601 E Street, NW
Washington, DC 20049
(202) 434-3750
dcertner@aarp.org

American Municipal Power, Inc.

Marc S. Gerken, P.E.
President & CEO
1111 Schrock Road, Suite 100
Columbus, Ohio 43229
mgerken@ampppartners.org

American Public Power Association

Susan N. Kelly
Senior Vice President of Policy Analysis and General Counsel
1875 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 1200
Washington, D.C. 20009
(202) 467-2933
skelly@publicpower.org

George Jepsen
Attorney General, State Of Connecticut

John S. Wright
Assistant Attorney General, Attorney General's Office
10 Franklin Square
New Britain, CT 06051
(860) 827-2620
John.Wright@ct.gov

California Municipal Utilities Association¹

David L. Modisette
Executive Director
915 L Street, Suite 1460
Sacramento CA 95814
(916) 326-5800
dmodisette@cmua.org

California Public Utilities Commission

Candace J. Morey
Staff Counsel
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
(415) 703-3211
cjm@cpuc.ca.gov

Office of Ratepayer Advocates
California Public Utilities Commission

Joseph P. Como
Acting Director
505 Van Ness Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102
(415)703-2381
joc@cpuc.ca.gov

¹ CMUA electric utility members include the Cities of Alameda, Anaheim, Azusa, Banning, Burbank, Cerritos, Colton, Corona, Glendale, Gridley, Healdsburg, Hercules, Lodi, Lompoc, Los Angeles, Moreno Valley, Needles, Palo Alto, Pasadena, Pittsburg, Rancho Cucamonga, Redding, Riverside, Roseville, Santa Clara, Shasta Lake, Ukiah, Vernon, and Victorville, as well as the Imperial, Merced, Modesto, Turlock Irrigation Districts, the Northern California Power Agency, Southern California Public Power Authority, Transmission Agency of Northern California, Lassen Municipal Utility District, Power and Water Resources Pooling Authority, Sacramento Municipal Utility District, the Trinity and Truckee Donner Public Utility Districts, the Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, and the City and County of San Francisco, Hetch-Hetchy.

Competitive Power Ventures, Inc.

Braith Kelly
Senior Vice-President
50 Braintree Hill Office Park, Suite 300
Braintree, MA 02184
(861) 546-2008
bkelly@cpv.com

Connecticut Department of Energy & Environmental Protection

Katie Dykes
Deputy Commissioner
10 Franklin Square
New Britain, CT 06051
(860) 827-2805
katie.dykes@ct.gov

Connecticut Public Utility Regulatory Authority

Arthur H. House
Chairman
10 Franklin Square
New Britain, CT 06051
(860) 827-2658
Arthur.house@ct.gov

Consumer Federation of America

Stephen Brobeck
Executive Director
1620 I Street, NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
(202) 387-6121
sbrobeck@consumerfed.org

Consumer Power Advocates²

Catherine M. Luthin
Executive Director
535 Main Street
Allenhurst, NJ 07755
(732) 774-0005

² Consumer Power Advocates members include New York Presbyterian Hospital, Continuum Health Partners, Fordham University, Memorial Sloan-Kettering Cancer Center, Montefiore Medical Center, Mount Sinai Medical Center, New York University and New York University Hospitals Center,

cluthin@luthin.com

Delaware Municipal Electric Corporation

Patrick E. McCullar
President & CEO
22 Artisan Drive
Smyrna, DE 19977
pmccullar@demecinc.net

Electricity Consumers Resource Council (ELCON)

John A. Anderson
President and CEO
1101 K Street, NW, Suite 700
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 682-1390
janderson@elcon.org

Green Mountain Power

Doug Smith
Director of Power Supply
163 Acorn Lane
Colchester, VT 05446
(802) 655-8462
Doug.smith@greenmountainpower.com

Heartland Consumers Power District

Russell Olson
Chief Executive Officer
P.O. Box 248
Madison, SD 57042
(605) 256-6536
rolson@hcpd.com

Multiple Intervenors³

Michael B. Mager, Esq.
Couch White, LLP, Attorneys for Multiple Intervenors
540 Broadway, P.O. Box 22222
Albany, NY 12201

³ Multiple Intervenors is an unincorporated association of over 55 large industrial, commercial and institutional energy consumers with manufacturing and other facilities located throughout New York State.

(518) 320-3409
mmager@couchwhite.com

National Association of State Utility Consumer Advocates

Charles Acquard
Executive Director
8380 Colesville Road, Suite 101
Silver Spring, MD 20910
(301) 589-6313
charlie@nasuca.org

National Consumer Law Center,[®] on behalf of its low-income clients

Olivia Wein
Staff Attorney
1001 Connecticut Avenue, NW, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20036-5528
(202) 452-6252
owein@nclc.org

National Rural Electric Cooperative Association

Jay Morrison
Vice President, Regulatory Issues
Pam Silberstein
Associate Director, Power Supply Issues
Government Relations
4301 Wilson Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22203
(703) 907-5825 (Jay Morrison)
Jay.Morrison@nreca.coop
(703) 907-5739 (Pam Silberstein)
Pam.Silberstein@nreca.coop

New York Association of Public Power⁴

Paul J. Pallas
President
P.O. Box 950
Rockville Centre, NY 11571

⁴ NYAPP member utilities are Delaware County Electric Cooperative, Inc., Village of Freeport, Green Island Power Authority, Village of Greenport, Jamestown Board of Public Utilities, Town of Massena Electric Department, Oneida-Madison Electric Cooperative, Inc., Otsego Electric Cooperative, Inc., Village of Rockville Centre, Salamanca Board of Public Utilities, City of Sherrill Power & Light, Village of Sherburne, and Steuben Rural Electric Cooperative, Inc.

(516) 678-9305
pjpallas@rvcny.us

New York Department of State Utility Intervention Unit

Saul A. Rigberg, Esq.
Intervenor Attorney
One Commerce Plaza, Suite 1120
Albany, NY 12231
(518) 408-3746
saul.rigberg@dps.ny.gov

New York Power Authority

Paul Tartaglia
Senior Vice President, Energy Resource Management
123 Main Street
White Plains, NY 10601

New York State Department of Public Service

Kimberly A. Harriman
Acting General Counsel
Three Empire State Plaza
Albany, NY 12223
(518) 474-2510
kimberly.harriman@dps.ny.gov

Northeast Public Power Association⁵

⁵ NEPPA members are Ashburnham Municipal Light Plant, Barton Village Electric Department, Belmont Municipal Light Department, Boylston Municipal Light Department, Braintree Electric Light Department, Burlington Electric Department, Chester Municipal Electric Light Department, Chicopee Municipal Lighting Plant, Concord Municipal Light Plant, Connecticut Municipal Electric Energy Cooperative, Danvers Electric Division, East Norwalk Electric Department (Third Taxing District), Eastern Maine Electric Cooperative, Inc., Energy New England, Fox Islands Electric Cooperative, Inc., Georgetown Municipal Light Department, Groton Electric Light Department, Groton Utilities (City Of Groton Dept. Of Utilities), Groveland Municipal Light Department, Hardwick Electric Department, Hingham Municipal Lighting Plant, Holden Municipal Light Department, Holyoke Gas & Electric Department, Houlton Water Company, Hudson Light and Power Department, Hull Municipal Light Plant, Ipswich Municipal Light Department, Jewett City Department of Public Utilities, Kennebunk Light and Power District, Littleton Electric Light & Water Departments, Littleton Water & Light Department, Madison Electric Works, Mansfield Municipal Electric Department, Marblehead Municipal Light Department, Mass Development/Devens Utility, Massachusetts Municipal Wholesale Electric Company, Merrimac Municipal Light Department, Middleborough Gas and Electric Department, Middleton Municipal Electric Department, Mohegan Tribal Utility Authority, New Hampshire Electric Cooperative, Inc., Norwich Public Utilities, Pascoag Utility District, Paxton Municipal Light Department, Peabody Municipal Light Plant, Princeton Municipal Light Department, Reading Municipal Light Department, Rowley Municipal Lighting Plant, Russell Municipal Lighting Company, Shrewsbury Electric and Cable Operations, South Hadley Electric Light Department, South Norwalk Electric & Water, Sterling Municipal Light Department, Swan's Island Electric Cooperative, Inc., Taunton Municipal Lighting Plant, Templeton Municipal Light and Water Plant, Town of Stowe Electric Department, Town of Wallingford Electric

Larry Brownell
Executive Director
200 New Estate Road
Littleton, MA 01460
(978) 540-2200
lbrownell@neppa.org

Public Citizen

Tyson Slocum
Director, Public Citizen's Energy Program
215 Pennsylvania Ave SE
Washington, DC 20003
(202) 454-5191
tslocum@citizen.org

Public Power Association of New Jersey⁶

James A. Jablonski
Executive Director
PO Box 206
Seaside Heights, NJ 08751
(732) 236-7241
ppanj@tellurian.com

Public Utility Law Project of New York, Inc.

Gerald A. Norlander, Esq.
Executive Director
P.O. Box 10787, Albany, NY 12201
(518) 281-5991
gnorland44@gmail.com

Division, Vermont Public Power Supply Authority, Village of Enosburg Falls Water & Light Department, Village of Hyde Park, Village Of Jacksonville Electric Company, Village of Johnson Water and Light Department, Village of Ludlow Electric Light Department, Village Of Lyndonville Electric Department, Village Of Morrisville Water & Light Dept, Village Of Orleans Electric Department, Village of Swanton Electric Department, Wakefield Municipal Gas & Light Department, Washington Electric Cooperative, Inc., Wellesley Municipal Light Plant, West Boylston Municipal Lighting Plant, Westfield Gas & Electric Light Department, Wolfeboro Municipal Electric Department, and Woodsville Water & Light Department.

⁶ Members of the PPA NJ include: the Boroughs of Butler, Lavallette, Madison, Milltown, Park Ridge, Pemberton, Seaside Heights, South River, the City of Vineland, and Sussex Rural Electric Cooperative.

The Utility Reform Network (TURN)

Tom Long
Legal Director
785 Market Street, Suite 1400
San Francisco, CA 94103
(415) 929-8876 x303
tlong@turn.org

Transmission Access Policy Study Group (TAPS)

John Twitty
Executive Director
4203 E. Woodland St.
Springfield, MO 65809
(417) 838-8576
835consulting@gmail.com

cc: Ms. Jamie Simler, Director, Office of Energy Policy and Innovation (OEPI)
James A. Pederson, Associate Director, OEPI
Mason Emmett, Deputy Director, OEPI
Jeffrey Dennis, Director, Division of Policy Development, OPEI
Julie Simon, Deputy Director, Division of Policy Development, OPEI